

EDINBURGH GROUP DOUNREAY PARTICLES MEETING

Date Thursday 22nd March 2007
Time: 1000 to 1400 hours
Location: Caledonian Hilton, Edinburgh

Present:

Chair	Elizabeth Gray	Scottish Executive
Attendees	Sandra Jack	Scottish Executive
	Ian Hall	Scottish Executive
	Arthur Johnston	Scottish Executive, Health Department
	Hugh Fearn	SEPA
	Paul Dale	SEPA/DPAG
	Keith Boddy	DPAG
	Peter Kayes	Consultant to Highland Council
	Ian Laidlaw	NDA
	Bill Fernie	Particles Consultation Steering Group
	Alex Elliot	COMARE
	David Welham	Health Protection Agency
	Will Munro	Foods Standards Agency
	Phil Cartwright	UKAEA
	Joe Toole	UKAEA
	June Love	UKAEA

Apologies:

Ian Hargrave	Highland Council
Simon Middlemas	UKAEA
George Hunter	SEPA
Byron Tilly	SEPA (Hugh Fearn deputised)

MINUTES

1. WELCOME

Elizabeth Gray welcomed everyone to the meeting.

2. MINUTES OF THE OCTOBER MEETING

The following changes were made to the minutes:

Page 1: Apologies - George Hunter represented SEPA and not Scottish Executive as stated.

Page 4: 4th bullet point [When is the DPAG report likely to be available?]. 4th line: add 'issue' after postpone. 5th line – adverse should read averse.

[Secretary's note - The changes have been made to the October minutes].

3. ACTIONS ARISING FROM PREVIOUS MEETING

Actions completed since last meeting

Action(Oct 2006)01: June Love to circulate previous minutes to group to allow publication on website. *Action complete – comments now received and minutes updated to reflect amendments.*

Action(Oct 2006)03: Monitoring contract to be put on the agenda for discussion at next meeting. *Action complete – on agenda.*

Action(Oct 2006)05: UKAEA to make available all identified information to DPAG. *Action complete – regular contact with DPAG is maintained and information will continue to be sent as appropriate.*

Action(Oct 2006)06: UKAEA to provide a process timeline for BPEO process. *Action complete – timeline provided for March meeting.*

Action(Oct 2006)07: Information sent to DPAG or SEPA should also be made available to COMARE. *Action complete – COMARE satisfied they are receiving information.*

Action(Oct 2006)08: June Love to re-circulate contacts list so that members can update information. *Action complete.*

Action(Oct 2006)09: June Love to organise next meeting for March/April 07. *Action complete.*

Actions ongoing from last meeting

Action(Oct 2006)02: UKAEA to circulate updated technical resume to group once drafted. *Action ongoing:* Draft Technical Resume sent on 10th October to K Boddy, P Dale and I Baikie for external review. Currently the structure is being amended to re-align with the DPAG report. Final issue will be circulated to members and published by 27th April.

Action(Oct 2006)04: UKAEA to set up a meeting (after DPAG report) with Highland Council, SEPA and the Health Board to discuss issues relating to signs at Dunnet. *Action ongoing – See(March 2007) 02*

It was noted that one of the signs at Dunnet beach had been vandalised and needed to be replaced by UKAEA. The delay in replacing the sign was because UKAEA had hoped to have agreed appropriate wording for new signs. However there had been a delay in this

and UKAEA agreed to ensure the sign presently used is replaced until new wording could be agreed.

Action(Mar 2007) 01: UKAEA to ensure sign at Dunnet is replaced urgently.
Action complete – sign replaced on 26.3.2007).

Action (Mar 2007) 02: to pursue (Oct 2006) 04 action above by 27/04/2007 02
Highland Council should now urgently review the information and take advice from SEPA/NHS Highland to ensure appropriate action is taken for signs at Dunnet.

4. SCOTTISH EXECUTIVE UPDATE

The Radioactively contaminated land regulations will come into effect on 30th October 2007. SEPA will be the responsible authority and interface with local authorities. The regulations will also cover the marine environment and will have to consider out to 3 miles below the low water tide mark. The future scope of the particles work will need to consider the implications of these regulations..

5. NDA UPDATE

- This would be his last meeting; Randall Bargelt would be his replacement.
- Sellafield were looking at the work done at Dounreay on particles
- Confirmed there was a reference strategy in the lifetime plan
- UKAEA's assets would transfer to NDA on 1st April 2007. Meetings had been held with regulators and there is a need to ensure SEPA is content.

Action(Mar 2007)03: SEPA to confirm it is content with transfer of assets in relations to particles.

Action(Mar 2007)04: SEPA to ensure relevant personel are aware of meetings taking place with NDA on asset transfers.

The group, thanked Ian for his input to these meetings and wished him success for the future.

6. DPAG UPDATE

- Third Report had been published on 21 November 2006
- DPAG extended for a further 18 months
- Making progress but concerned timescale is tight
- Considering report from UKAEA on remediation of the diffuser
- Solubility testing of 150 particles required
- COMARE will carry out further beach trials to test improved Groundhog Evolution in May/June 2007.
- Reviewing data provided by UKAEA on Sandside beach height.

- No formal comments had been received from UKAEA and/or SEPA on the Third Report.

Action(Mar 2007)05: UKAEA and SEPA to provide DPAG Secretary with formal comments on DPAG's Third Report.

Action(Mar 2007)06: UKAEA to ensure DPAG Chair and members are added to the list of people alerted following a particle find.

7. UKAEA UPDATE

There was a presentation – slides attached, covering::

- Particle finds at Sandside and Dounreay foreshore
- Monitoring contract
- Access for monitoring
- Plans for offshore work in 2007
- Ongoing research and development work
- Work to inform DPAG's Fourth Report
- BPEO progress

Action(Mar 2007)07: UKAEA to circulate presentation electronically to all members. *Action complete – see Appendix 1.* In discussions the following points were noted and actions required:

- The beach height at Sandside had dramatically changed during the heavy storms. A report on the beach height had been provided to DPAG for consideration.

Action(Mar 2007)08: UKAEA to circulate Sandside beach height report to all members. *[the report is being updated with detection probabilities and will be issued once complete.]*

- An additional monitoring vehicle would be available to allow an enhanced monitoring regime. It was queried whether there were other environmental issues which might arise by utilising more monitoring vehicles.

Action(Mar 2007) 09: SEPA to provide advice as to whether there is any other environmental impacts from operating additional monitoring vehicles.

- Concern over the perception which an additional vehicle may raise. UKAEA noted that the third vehicle was required to ensure the statutory monitoring programme was achievable.
- It was expected that divers would be on standby to carry out off-shore retrievals under certain circumstances. This would be carried out in June/July 2007 with a summary report made available to DPAG by August 2007.

- An OJEU notice had been placed for off-shore remediation work with five companies short-listed to provide details of their technology for detection and remotely retrieving particles. Plan is to demonstrate suitable technology in offshore trials in August/September 2007.

Action(Mar 2007) 10: UKAEA to ensure that the Marine laboratory and Crown Estate are aware of planned and future off-shore trials.(that they are aware of current plans).

Action(Mar 2007)11: UKAEA to ensure off-shore trials and other particles work are reported to NDA ie. within the Dashboard report.

- Particle density work will be complete by the end of July.
- 150 particles will undergo solubility analysis. This will be done to assess the prevalence of uranium oxide particles which may have originated from DFR and MTR. UKAEA will report to DPAG on the timescale for this work.
- DPAG are considering the options relating to the remediation of the old diffuser which may contain particles.
- BGS had carried out studies on beach elevation and depth of sand at Dunnet in May and October 2005, after the finding of a small DFR particle and a piece of contaminated plastic in March that year. They calculated a volume increase of 140,000 cubic metres of sand in this 5 month period. A similar study is under consideration for Sandside. The depth of sand across the beach area would allow calculations of changes to beach volume month-on-month and may also help to determine which part of the beach is most suitable for excavation trials.
- BPEO consultation work was ongoing – the timetable outlined in presentation.

Action(Mar 2007)12: UKAEA and NDA to ensure funding is available to cover the full scope of work.

Within the current Dounreay programme there is an outline plan for both on-shore and off-shore work which UKAEA believe is reasonable. The method for implementation may change and this has been included as a risk or uncertainty.

8. SEPA UPDATE

- SEPA are currently in final stages of statutory consultation on the variation of UKAEA's discharge authorisation. They were currently awaiting a response from NII.

- The authorisation would be moved into a multi-media authorisation. TIDs would be withdrawn and the current requirements for monitoring beaches will be incorporated into the multi-media authorisation.
- The authorisation will be coming forward to Scottish Executive next week.
- A review of monitoring requirements will take into account DPAG's report and the output from the UKAEA's BPEO study.
- SEPA have requested information from UKAEA on the options for sealing the old diffuser supported by an environmental safety case. It may be that remediation will have to address issues in line with contaminated land regulations.

Action(Mar 2007)13: Scottish Executive to respond to SEPA on discharge authorisation variation by the end of May.

- It was noted that DPAG's recommendations, the authorisation issues around RSA requirements and the Radioactively contaminated land regulations, while separate, are all linked when considering monitoring regime.

Action(Mar 2007)14: SEPA to review the beach monitoring programme.

Action(Mar 2007)15: SEPA to consider how to respond on particles beach monitoring in relation to the Radioactively contaminated land regulations.

- BPEO will eventually come forward to SEPA for review and approval.

Action(Mar 2007)16: SEPA to confirm if there are potential problems on resources and timescales to take the BPEO work forward.

9. COMARE UPDATE

- Particles solubility experiments will aid understanding of the stochastic risk from certain types of particles
- Have requested further information from UKAEA on options for remediating the old diffuser.
- COMARE will test new improved Groundhog Evolution in May/June 2007. This will involve burying sources to a depth of 40cm and using smaller sources at surface level.
- COMARE have produced their 10th and 11th report on childhood leukaemia. Further studies will look at Sellafield and Dounreay to see if previous information on clusters still exist.

Action(Mar 2007)17: NDA to ensure Chair of Epidemiology is aware of COMARE studies.

Action(Mar 2007)18: DPAG and COMARE update will be taken together on agenda for next meeting.

Action(Mar 2007)19: SEPA to ensure all the mechanisms are in place for COMARE's beach trials.

10. HIGHLAND COUNCIL UPDATE

- On the matter of warning signs displayed at beaches and the recent retrieval of a particle with an activity of 500 KBq (Cs137), Highland Council chaired a meeting with SEPA and NHS Highland to consider risks and any controls on access that might then arise. Members were asked to note that, following this review, the Council's prime point of contact on matters related to the management of particle issues in and around Dounreay is the Director of Planning and Development.

On the matter of developing a set of Q&As prior to launching the next phase of the Particle BPEO, it was noted that UKAEA had prepared draft responses to the set of questions that had been submitted previously by Highland Council at the request of the Group and that the combined Q&As had now been circulated by UKAEA to members for comment.

Action(Mar 2007)20: All members to comment on questions and answers and add any further questions and answers that need considered by 20 April 2007.

Action(Mar 2007)21: All members to look at responses to questions and make comments on language and accuracy. by 20 April 2007

11. FOOD STANDARDS AGENCY UPDATE

- Considering DPAG's recommendations in relation to food assessment and the FEPA fishing exclusion zone.

12. HEALTH PROTECTION AGENCY UPDATE

- HPA will consider COMARE's research work.

13. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

- SEPA noted that they would be considering the implications for landfill 42, under the Radioactively contaminated land regulations.

Action(Mar)22: NDA/UKAEA to consult with SEPA on Landfill 42.

- UKAEA updated the group on the status of information for Sandside information board.

Action(Mar)23: UKAEA to provide Sandside information electronically to Scottish executive.

- Date of next meeting in July.

Action(Mar 2007)24: Members' availability to be checked.

Action(Mar 2007)25: All members to provide comments on previous minutes by the end of June 2007.

Action(Mar 2007)26: Add DPAG and COMARE meeting dates into work programme timeline.

Action(Mar 2007)27: List of actions and dates to members by the end of March 2007.

Action(Mar 2007)28: Contact list to be circulated to all members to update details by end of March 2007.

Dounreay Particles Group

PROGRESS ON ACTIONS – updated as actions completed.

No	Action	Action on	Action due
Oct02	Update technical resume and circulate to members. Ongoing – editing needs to be complete to align with DPAG report and cross references. Expected to be available on 27th July.	UKAEA	27 th April 2007
Oct04 & Mar 02	UKAEA to set up a meeting (after DPAG report) with Highland Council, SEPA and the Health Board to discuss issues relating to signs at Dunnet. Action complete – Highland Council took the decision to take down signs on their land. Signs still remain on private landowner's land.	Highland Council	15 th April 2007
Mar01	Sign at Dunnet beach needs replaced. Action complete – sign replaced on 27th March 07.	UKAEA	26 March 2007
Mar03	SEPA to confirm that it is content with transfer of assets in relations to particles. Complete.	Paul Dale	End of March
Mar04	SEPA to ensure relevant personnel are aware of meetings taking place with NDA on asset transfers. Complete.	Hugh Fearn	End of March
Mar05	UKAEA and SEPA to provide DPAG Secretary with formal comments on DPAG's Third Report: Action complete – both UKAEA and SEPA have formally submitted comments to DPAG.	UKAEA/SEPA	20 th April 2007
Mar06	UKAEA to ensure Keith Boddy is added to the list of people alerted following a particle find. Action complete.	UKAEA	Immediately
Mar07	Provide electronic copy of UKAEA's presentation. Action complete – will be circulated with minutes.	UKAEA	Circulate with draft minutes
Mar08	Circulate Sandside beach height report to all members. Action complete.	UKAEA	Immediately
Mar09	SEPA to provide advice as to whether there is any other environmental impacts from operating additional monitoring vehicles. Complete.	Hugh Fearn	20 th April 2007
Mar10	UKAEA to ensure that the Marine laboratory and Crown Estate are aware of off-shore trials. Complete.	UKAEA	27 April 2007
Mar11	UKAEA to ensure off-shore trials are reported within the Dashboard report. Action complete. Programmes Department will ensure this is done.	UKAEA	27 April 2007
Mar12	UKAEA and NDA to ensure funding is available to cover the full scope of work. Action complete – scope of work and funding is included in lifetime plan.	NDA/UKAEA	20 April 2007
Mar13	Scottish Executive to respond to SEPA on discharge authorisation variation by the end of May. Complete.	Scottish Executive	End of June 2007
Mar14	SEPA to review the beach monitoring programme. Action ongoing.	SEPA	End of June 2007
Mar15	SEPA to consider how to respond on particles	SEPA	End of June 2007

	beach monitoring in relation to the contaminated land regulations. Action ongoing.		
Mar16	SEPA to confirm if there are potential problems on resources and timescales to take the BPEO work forward. Action complete.	SEPA	End of June 2007
Mar17	Ian Laidlaw to ensure NDA Chair of Epidemiology is aware of COMARE studies. Action complete – Ian Laidlaw has notified Dr Hudson, who has responsibility for this area, and Donald Urquhart, who leads for the NDA on this issue.	NDA	End of April 2007
Mar18	June Love to put DPAG and COMARE update together for next agenda. Action complete.	June Love	When drawing up Agenda for next meeting July 2007
Mar19	SEPA to ensure all the mechanisms are in place for COMARE's beach trials. Action complete. Trials had been completed.	Paul Dale	4 th April 2007
Mar20	All members to comment on questions and add any further questions that need considered by 20 th April. Action complete – comments received – final draft will be issued with agenda.	All members	20 th April 2007
Mar21	All members to look at responses to questions and make comments on language and accuracy.	All members	20 th April 2007
Mar22	NDA/UKAEA to consult with SEPA on Landfill 42.	NDA/UKAEA	End of June 2007
Mar23	UKAEA to provide Sandside information electronically to Scottish Executive. Action complete.	UKAEA	End of April 2007
Mar24	Availability to be checked for next meeting in July. Action complete – 16th July has been identified.	June Love	End of April 2007
Mar25	All members to provide comments on previous minutes. Action ongoing.	June Love	End of June 2007
Mar26	Add DPAG and COMARE meeting dates into work programme deadline. Ongoing – DPAG dates included.	DPAG/COMARE	End of April 2007
Mar27	List of actions and dates to members . Action complete.	UKAEA	End of April 2007
Mar28	Contact list to be circulated to all members to update details . Action complete.	June Love	End of March 2007

DATES

End March 2007	Multi media discharge authorisation will be sent to Scottish Executive
16 May 2007	DPAG meeting
End May 2007	Scottish Executive to respond to SEPA on multi-media discharge authorisation.
June/July 2007	Off-shore studies carried out.
16 July 2007	Dounreay Particles: Edinburgh meeting
17 July 2007	DPAG meeting
July 2007	Results of particle density work
August 2007	Results of off-shore studies complete and summary report provided to DPAG.
Aug/September 2007	Off-shore testing of technologies for detection and remote retrieval of particles.
5 September 2007	DPAG meeting
6 November 2007	DPAG meeting